



Nematicidal Properties of *Moringa oleifera*, *Chromolaena odorata* and *Panicum maximum* and their Control Effects on Pathogenic Nematodes of Yam

Anthony A. Mainoo^{1*} and Ben K. Banful²

¹Adventist Development and Relief Agency (ADRA Ghana), P.O.Box 1435, Accra, Ghana.

²Faculty of Agriculture, Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology, University Post Office, Private Mailbag, Kumasi, Ghana.

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration between both authors. Both authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/JEAI/2019/v31i230066

Editor(s):

(1) Dr. Rusu Teodor, Professor, Department of Technical and Soil Sciences, University of Agricultural Sciences and Veterinary Medicine Cluj-Napoca, Romania.

Reviewers:

(1) Raúl Leonel Grijalva-Contreras, Instituto Nacional de Investigaciones Forestales Agrícolas y Pecuarias, México.

(2) Mahmoud M. A. Youssef, National Research Centre, Egypt.

Complete Peer review History: <http://www.sdiarticle3.com/review-history/46923>

Received 21 November 2018

Accepted 24 January 2019

Published 22 February 2019

Original Research Article

ABSTRACT

A field study was conducted at Atonsu, Sekyere Central District, Ghana from 2013 to 2014, to (i) determine the effects of *Moringa oleifera*, *Chromolaena odorata* and *Panicum maximum* as ex-situ mulches, on soil nematodes population after two years of yam cropping and (ii) assess the effects of the soil nematodes on the yield and physical tuber quality of yam. The field experiment was a 3x3 factorial arrangement in a randomized complete block design with three replications. The first factor was ex-situ mulch types at three levels; *Panicum maximum* (farmers' choice), *Chromolaena odorata* and *Moringa oleifera*. The second factor was natural fallow aged systems at three levels: 3, 5, and 7 years old. Data collected included nematode population changes, total tuber yield of yam and tuber physical quality assessment. Generally, *Meloidogyne* spp., *Pratylenchus* spp., and *Scutellonema* spp. were the nematode genera identified. However, *Scutellonema* spp. was found to be the most pathogenic nematode affecting yam tuber yield and physical quality. *Chromolaena* and *Moringa* mulches suppressed *Scutellonema* spp. populations by 80.7% and 76.2% respectively as

*Corresponding author: E-mail: mainooatony@gmail.com;

compared to the *Panicum maximum* mulch. The suppressed *Scutellonema spp.* population significantly contributed to higher tuber yields and good tuber physical quality under the *M. oleifera* and *C. odorata* mulches in comparison to the *P. maximum* mulch.

Keywords: *Nematodes populations; yam; tuber physical quality; ex-situ mulches; tuber yield.*

1. INTRODUCTION

Across West and Central Africa, yam plays key roles in the economy, food and livelihoods [1]. For instance in Nigeria, yam contributes 12% to the Agricultural Gross Domestic Product (AGDP) [2] with about sixty million people depending on it for food and livelihood. In Ghana, yam's contribution to the AGDP is 16 percent [3,4] and serves as a famine reserve- and cash-crop for poor resource farmers [5].

In world export trade, Ghana, Costa Rica and USA are the three largest exporters of yam accounting for about 70% of global trade [6]. It has been estimated that an average of over 25% of the yield of yam is lost annually due to diseases and pest, particularly nematodes [7]. These nematodes cause not only a reduction in yam yields but also a profound physical damage to yam tubers thereby rendering them unappealing to consumers and subsequently commanding a very low market value [8]. Earlier reports indicate that yam tubers are significantly damaged by three major nematode species, and genera, namely, *Scutellonema spp.*, *Meloidogyne spp.* and *Pratylenchus coffeae* [9,10,11,12,13]. These nematode genera are predominant in West and Central Africa and therefore have profound influence on yam tuber yields and physical quality [14]. For instance, *Scutellonema spp.* damage is characterized by the rotting of the tuber to depths of about 2 cm into the tuber [15,16]. Bridge et al. [17] reported that *Scutellonema spp.* is very difficult to control because a wide range of other crops and some weeds support its populations. In spite of this drawback, the control of *Scutellonema spp.* is essential to the improvement of yam yields and its subsequent tuber physical quality. There are reports to suggest that the leaves of *M. oleifera* and *C. odorata* possess nematicidal properties for the control of *M. incognita* and *M. javanica* in eggplant and cowpea production resulting in their increased yields [18,19]. However there is a dearth of such information on other pathogenic nematodes and on other crops.

The objectives of the present study therefore were to (i) determine the effects of *Moringa*

oleifera, *Chromolaena odorata* and *Panicum maximum* as ex-situ mulches, on soil nematodes population after two years of yam cropping and (ii) assess the effects of the soil nematodes on the yield and physical tuber quality of the yam.

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 Experimental Locations, Design and Procedure

The study was carried out at Atonsu village which had a good representation of all the three natural fallow ages: 3, 5 and 7 year that would be used. The 3 and 5 years old natural fallows were previously cropped to cowpea and cassava, respectively, while the 7 year old natural fallow was previously cropped to cocoyam.

The experimental design was a 3 x 3 factorial arrangement in randomized complete block with three replications. The first factor was natural fallow age at three levels, namely, 3, 5 and 7 year. The second factor was mulch type at three levels comprising, *Chromolaena odorata* mulch (leaf residues), *Moringa oleifera* mulch and *Panicum maximum* mulch (control -farmer practice). The plot size within each natural fallow age system was 5 m x 4 m with an experimental area of 2,000 m² (50 m x 40 m).

The experimental location is within longitude 0.05° and 1.30° W and Latitudes 6.55° and 7.30° N and falls within the Forest-Savannah-Transition Ecozone of Ghana. The area is characterized by bimodal rainfall pattern with the major season starting from March to middle of July and the minor starting from mid-August to November. Maximum Environmental temperatures during the two year experimental period ranged between 28.0°C and 33.0°C while the monthly rainfall during the two cropping seasons ranged between 28.8 and 290.4 mm. Chromic Lixisols were the most extensive in the study area.

Preparation of ridges, plots demarcation and all other cultural practices were done in accordance with the methodology of [4]. The inter-ridge

spacing was 1 m while the inter-plot spacing was 3 m.

Yam (*Dioscorea rotundata* var. Puna) setts with uniform size and a mean weight of 250 g were planted on the ridges at a spacing of 1 m x 0.5 m. There were 36 plants per plot (18,000 plants ha⁻¹). Two croppings were done over the study period, namely, in 2013 and in 2014.

All three mulch types were applied at a rate of 0.5 kg plant⁻¹ (10 t ha⁻¹) in both years of cropping. There were two applications of each mulch type during each cropping period. The first application was done 28 days after planting of yam while the second was done 75 days after planting [20].

Data collected included, nutrient content of mulches, soil nematodes populations, yam tuber yield and tuber physical quality.

2.2 Data Analysis

Data were subjected to analysis of variance using GENTST version 10. Treatment means were separated using Tukeys Honestly Significant Difference (HSD) at 5% level of probability.

3. RESULTS

3.1 Nutrient Content of Leaves and Stems of the Three Mulches

Among the three mulches, *M. oleifera* leaf residues had significantly ($p < 0.05$) greater contents of nitrogen, phosphorus, potassium, calcium and magnesium than *C. odorata* and *P. maximum* (Table 1). *C. odorata* leaves also had significantly higher contents of all the nutrients studied than *P. maximum*. The nutrient composition of the leaf residues were therefore found to be in the order: *M. oleifera* > *C. odorata* > *P. maximum*.

Generally, there were higher contents of nitrogen and calcium in the leaves than in the stems except for potassium, which had higher content in the stems than in the leaves for all the mulches (Table 1). The C/N ratios of the leaf residues of *C. odorata*, *M. oleifera* and *P. maximum* were 18.73:1, 8.38:1, and 43.12:1, respectively. For the stems, the C/N ratios ranged from 59.54 to 80.52.

3.2 Effects of Three Mulches on Soil Nematodes Populations

3.2.1 Initial soil nematodes populations

Soil nematode genera initially found in the soil were *Meloidogyne* spp., *Scutellonema* spp., *Pratylenchus* spp., *Rotylenchus* spp., *Helicotylenchus* spp., and *Tylenchus* spp. Significant differences were observed between the fallow ages for populations of *Meloidogyne* spp., *Scutellonema* spp., and *Rotylenchus* spp. (Table 2). The 3-year fallow system recorded the highest population for *Scutellonema* spp. and the least for *Meloidogyne* spp. and *Rotylenchus* spp. Contrarily, the 5-year fallow system recorded the highest population for *Meloidogyne* spp., and the least for *Scutellonema* spp. For the 7-year fallow system, the highest population was found in *Rotylenchus* spp., and the least in *Scutellonema* spp. There were no significant differences in the populations of *Pratylenchus* spp., *Helicotylenchus* spp. and *Tylenchus* spp. for all three fallow aged systems.

3.3 Changes in Soil Nematode Population after Mulching

There were significant increases in the population of *Meloidogyne* spp. under all three mulches, two years after application and cropping. The population increases in comparison to the initial were 223.2 %, 421.5% and 270.0 % for *P. maximum*, *C. odorata* and *M. oleifera*, respectively (Table 3). As regards, *Scutellonema* spp., population increase was only found under *P. maximum*, about 406.0%. Under both *C. odorata* and *M. oleifera* mulches, however, no significant differences were found in the populations of *Scutellonema* spp. when the populations after two years was compared to the initial. There were no significant differences between the initial and two years populations of *Pratylenchus* spp. and *Rotylenchus* spp.

3.4 Tuber Physical Damage due to Nematodes

There were no significant fallow ages x mulch type interactions for tuber physical damage due to nematodes. Similarly, there were no significant differences between the mulches for nematode-related tuber physical damage. Furthermore, there were no significant differences between the fallow aged systems for nematode-related tuber physical damage. Generally, tuber damage ranged between 0.29 % and 1.38 %.

Table 1. Nutrient contents of leaves and stems of *P. maximum*, *C. odorata* and *M. oleifera* used in the study [21]

Mulch type	%N	%P	%K	%Ca	%Mg	C/N
Leaves						
<i>P. maximum</i>	0.90c	0.13c	2.00c	0.29c	0.26c	43.12:1
<i>C. odorata</i>	1.60b	0.24b	2.52b	0.44b	0.50b	18.73:1
<i>M. oleifera</i>	3.87a	0.29a	2.88a	0.50a	0.59a	8.38:1
HSD (0.05)	0.039	0.023	0.138	0.054	0.068	
Stems						
<i>P. maximum</i>	0.56a	0.18ab	3.87a	0.18b	0.26b	69.46:1
<i>C. odorata</i>	0.50a	0.14b	3.05c	0.23ab	0.24b	80.52:1
<i>M. oleifera</i>	0.57a	0.22a	3.36b	0.29a	0.31a	59.54:1
HSD (0.05)	0.087	0.041	0.096	0.076	0.043	

Means with the same subscript within a column are not significantly different at $p > 0.05$

Table 2. Initial soil nematode population in the three natural fallow aged systems

Fallow aged system	<i>Meloidogyne</i> spp.	<i>Scutellonema</i> spp.	<i>Rotylenchus</i> spp.
3-year	19.67b	14.33a	2.00b
5-year	40.33a	1.33b	14.00b
7-year	29.00a	9.33a	68.00a
HSD	19.72	7.29	30.10

Means with the same subscript within a column do not differ significantly at $p > 0.05$

3.5 Tuber Yield of Yam

There were no significant fallow aged systems x mulch type interactions for any of the yield components over the two years of cropping. There were however significant differences between the mulches for tuber weight and subsequently tuber yield for both years of cropping. Tuber yield of yam under *M. oleifera* was significantly and consistently greater than those under *C. odorata* and *P. maximum*, (Table 4). The least tuber weight of yam was produced under *P. maximum*. In terms of the fallow aged systems, yam tuber yield was greatest under the 7-year fallow system, significantly heavier than those under 5-year and 3-year fallow systems after the first year of cropping. The least tuber weight was produced by yam under 5-year fallow. However, after the second year of

cropping, no significant differences were observed between the fallow aged systems for all the measured yield components.

5. DISCUSSION

Scutellonema spp. population under *P. maximum* significantly increased by 5 folds after two years of mulch application and cropping. Conversely, populations under *M. oleifera* and *C. odorata* mulches, did not change over the same period of application and cropping. The implication was that, in spite of the yam cropping, the *M. oleifera* and *C. odorata* mulches were able to prevent the multiplication of the *Scutellonema* spp., one of the most devastating species which causes considerable damage to yam tubers. These two mulches could therefore be considered as good agents for the biological control of the

Table 3. Effects of application of three mulch types on the populations of *Meloidogyne* spp. and *Scutellonema* spp. across the fallow aged systems

Sampling period	<i>Meloidogyne</i> spp.			<i>Scutellonema</i> spp.		
	Population (per 100 g soil)			Population (per 100g soil)		
	<i>P. maximum</i>	<i>C. odorata</i>	<i>M. oleifera</i>	<i>P. maximum</i>	<i>C. odorata</i>	<i>M. oleifera</i>
Initial	29.67b	29.67b	29.67b	8.33b	8.33a	8.33a
After two years of mulching	96.00a	154.89a	109.89a	42.00a	8.11a	10.00a
HSD (0.05)	58.14	88.77	78.45	23.38	6.55	12.02

Table 4. Effects of mulch types and fallow aged systems on total yam tuber yield over two years

Mulch type	Mean Tuber wt. (kg)	Total Tuber yield (t/ha)
<i>P. maximum</i>	1.10b	51.3b
<i>C. odorata</i>	1.25b	56.1b
<i>M. oleifera</i>	1.50a	70.5a
HSD (0.05)	0.24	6.62
Fallow age		
3-year	1.25b	31.38b
5-year	1.02b	30.35b
7-year	1.83a	43.16a
HSD (0.05)	0.45	10.48

Means with the same subscript within a column do not differ significantly ($p>0.05$)

Scutellonema spp. nematode. This is the first report of the nematicidal properties of *M. oleifera* in the control of *Scutellonema* spp. For *C. odorata*, the present study corroborates the findings of earlier studies which indicated that the direct application of *C. odorata* either as mulch or as in natural fallows, reduced the population of *Scutellonema* spp. [22,23,24]. The mechanism of control has been explained by the single or combined action of alkaloids, flavonoids, saponins, amides and ketones which are produced during decomposition of the candidate mulch material [25,26,27,28]. Many researchers [23] and [29] have in separate reports indicated that *C. odorata* possessed alkaloids, flavonoids and the other phytochemicals that conferred nematicidal properties on it. In addition, [30] and [31] had indicated that the saponins and tannins in *C. odorata* were responsible for the inhibition of the egg hatching ability of such nematodes. In addition, when the C: N ratio of the amendment is less than 20:1, more effect on nematodes is evident [32]. In the present study, *C. odorata*, *M. oleifera* mulches have C/N ratios less than 20:1, whereas *P. maximum* has C/N ratio more than 20:1 which explained more effect of the former mulches than the later mulch (*Panicum*). This result agreed with [33]. These positive nematicidal attributes of *M. oleifera* and *C. odorata* could partly be responsible for the heavier weighted yam tubers under them as compared to the *P. maximum* mulch. Also contributing to the good yields observed under *M. oleifera* and *C. odorata* were the high nutrient status of the leaves which most probably were released through decomposition, in synchrony with tuberization of the yam. The findings of the present study supports the report of [34] who indicated that tuber yield of yam under *C. odorata* mulch was significantly greater than that under *P. maximum*. The 7 year fallow, which had significantly higher tuber yield (43.16t/ha) than

the 5 year, (30.35t/ha and the 3-year (31.38t/ha) during the initial harvest, could be attributed to the significantly higher inherent nutrient status of the 7 year fallow. There was an initial significantly higher organic matter (O.M) content of 2.22% in the 7 year fallow than both the 5 year (O.M. content of 1.84%) and the 3 year fallow (O.M. content of 1.49%). The length of cropping and fallow periods depends on the inherent soil fertility and available nutrient amendments and these reflect in the yields from fallowed plots [35].

6. CONCLUSION

After two years of application and cropping, the ex-situ mulches, *C. odorata* and *M. oleifera* suppressed *Scutellonema* populations by 80.7% and 76.2% respectively as compared to the control mulch (*Panicum*). The suppressive effects of these mulches on *Scutellonema* spp. partly contributed to the significantly higher tuber yield sustenance of *M. oleifera* and *C. odorata* mulches as compared to *P. maximum* as well as to the very minimal (less than 2%) tuber physical damage observed. Both *Moringa* and *Chromolaena* could therefore be exploited for cultural management and suppression of the *Scutellonema* spp. through their use as mulch.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. FAO. Corporate document repository. Factors affecting storability of roots and tuber. Accessed 20 February, 2017. www.fao.org/docrep.

2. Nahanga V, Becvarova V. An analysis of yam production in Nigeria. *Acta Universitatis Agriculturae et Silviculturae Mendelianae Brunensis*. 2015;63(2):659-665.
3. FAO, Analysis of incentives and disincentives for yam in Ghana. Technical notes series, MAFAP, by Anaadumba P. 2013;42.
4. Ennin SA, Otoo E, Tetteh FM. Ridging, a mechanized alternative to mounding for yam and cassava production. *West African Journal of Applied Ecology*. 2009;15(1):25-36.
5. Norman PE. Cytological diversity of some yams *Dioscorea* spp. University of Kwazulu-Natal, assessed www.slideshare.net, January 10, 2017 MSc. Thesis; 2010.
6. UN COMTRADE. Yam sector development strategy, United Nations Comtrade Database-International Trade Statistics. Ghana. Ministry of trade and Industry. moti.gov.gh/sites/default/files, 2012. (Date accessed, August, 2017).
7. Nyadanu D, Dapaah H, Agyekum AD. Resistance to post harvest microbial rot in yam: Integration of genotype and storage methods. *African Crops Science Journal*. 2014;22(2):89-95.
8. Baimey H, Coyne D, Labuschagne N. Effect of fertilizer application on yam nematode (*Scutellonema bradys*) multiplication and consequent damage to yam (*Dioscorea* spp.) under field and storage conditions in Benin. *International Journal of Pest Management*. 2006;52(1): 63-70.
9. Plowright RA, Kwoseh CK. Farmer's perceptions of nematode disease in yams in Ghana and the prevalence of endoparasitic nematodes in stored tubers. *Nematologica*. 1998;44:558-559.
10. Plowright R, Kwoseh C. Identification of resistance to major nematode pests of yams (*Dioscorea* spp.) in West Africa. Crop Protection Programme. Final Technical report, CABI. Bioscience. 2000;30.
11. Bridge J, Coyne DL, Kwoseh C. Nematode parasites of tropical root and tuber crops. In: "Plant parasitic nematodes in subtropical and tropical agriculture" (Second edition). M. Luc, R. A. Sikora, J. Bridge (eds), CABI Wallingford, UK. 2011;221-258.
12. Caveness FE. Nematological Research at IITA 1969-1988: A summary of investigations. In. *Plant Health Management Research Monograph 2*. Lowe, ed. Ibadan, Nigeria. 1992;52.
13. Baimey HK. *Scutellonema bradys* as a pathogen of yam in Benin PhD dissertation; 2006. Available:<http://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/29022> (Date accessed: 25/02/18)
14. Coyne DL, Williamson VM, Banna AB. Analysis of the pathogenic, morphological and genetic variability of *Scutellonema bradys* on yam in West Africa. *Afr. Plant Prot*. 2006;12:1-11.
15. Nwauzor EC, Fawole B. Root knot nematodes on yams (*Dioscorea* spp.) in eastern Nigeria. Proceeding of the 3rd Research Planning Conference on Root-knot nematodes, *Meloidogyne* spp., Region IV and V, Ibadan, Nigeria. 1981;161-167.
16. Kwoseh CK. Identification of resistance to major nematode pest of yams (*Dioscorea* spp.) in West Africa. PhD dissertation. Dept of Agriculture, University of Reading, UK. 2000;196.
17. Bridge J, Hunt DJ, Hunt P. Plant parasitic nematodes of crops in Belize. *Nematropica*. 1996;26:111-119.
18. Murslain M, Javed N, Khan SA, Khan HA, Huma Abbas H, Kamran M. Combined efficacy of *Moringa oleifera* leaves and a fungus, *Trichoderma harzianum* against *Meloidogyne javanica* on eggplant. *Pakistan J. Zool*. 2014;46(3):827-832.
19. Claudius-Cole, AO, Aminu, AE. and Fawole, B. Evaluation of plant extracts in the management of root-knot nematode *Meloidogyne incognita* on cowpea [*Vigna unguiculata* (L) Walp]. *Mycopath*, 2010, 8: 53-60.
20. Agbede TM, Adekiya AO, Ogeh JS. Effects of Chromolaena and Tithonia mulches on soil properties, leaf nutrient composition, growth and yam yield. *West African Journal of Applied Ecology*. 2013;21(1):15-29.
21. Mainoo AA, Banful BK. Yam plant growth and tuber yield response to ex-situ mulches of *Moringa oleifera*, *Chromolaena odorata* and *Panicum maximum* under three natural fallow aged systems. *Annals of Ecology and Environmental Science*. 2(3):7-14.

22. Ajith K, Sheela S. Utilization of green leaves of neem and *upatorium* for the management of soil organisms in bhindi and cowpea. *Indian Journal of Nematology*. 1996;26:139-143.
23. Adekunle OK, Fawole B. Chemical and non-chemical control of *Meloidogyne incognita* infecting cowpea under field conditions. *Moor Journal of Agricultural Research*. 2003;4(1):94-99.
24. Adediran JA, Adegbite AA, Akinlosotu T, Agbaje GO, Taiwo LB, Owolade OF, Oluwatosin GA. Evaluation of fallow and cover crops for nematode suppression in three agroecologies of south western Nigeria. *African Journal of Biotechnology*. 2005;4(10):1034-1039.
25. Thoden TC, Oppre MB, Allmann JH. Pyrrolizidine alkaloids of *Chromolaena odorata* act as nematocidal agents and reduced infections of lettuce roots by *Meloidogyne incognita*. *Nematology*. 2007;9(3):343-349.
26. Akpheokhai IL, Cole AOC, Fawole B. Evaluation of some plant extracts for the management of *Meloidogyne incognita* on soybeans (*Glycine max*). *World J. Agric. Sci*. 2012;8(4):429-435.
27. Goswami BK, Vijayalakshmi V. Nematocidal properties of some indigenous plant materials against root-knot nematode *Meloidogyne*. (Incognita on tomato). *Ind. J. Nematol*. 1986;16:65-68.
28. Adegbite AA. Comparative effects of carbofuran and water extract of *Chromolaena odorata* on growth, yield and food components of root-knot nematode-infested soybean [*Glycine max* (L.) Merrill]. Ph.D Thesis. University of Ibadan, Nigeria. 2003;219.
29. Adegbite AA, Adesiyun SO. Root extracts of plants to control root-knot nematodes on edible soybean. *World Journal of Agricultural Sciences*. 2005;1(1):18-21.
30. Umar I, Mamman A. Nematicidal potential of *Faidherbia albida* fruit against *Meloidogyne javanica* on cowpea. *Pakistan Journal of Nematology*. 2014;32(1):77-83.
31. Pavaraj M, Bakavathiappan G, Baskaran S. Evaluation of some plant extracts for their nematocidal properties against root-knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita*. *Journal of Biopesticides*. 2012;5(Suppl); 106-110.
32. Stirling GR. Biological control of plant parasitic nematodes. Progress, problems and prospects. Wallingford, Oxon, UK: CAB International. 1991;275.
33. Youssef MMA, El-Nagdi WMA, Dawood MG. Effect of sugar beet plant residues on population density of root knot nematode, *Meloidogyne incognita* infecting cowpea and biochemical changes in treated plants. *Pakistan Journal of Nematology*. 2018; 36(1):41-48.
34. Adeniyun BO, Ojeniyi SO, Awodun MA. Relative effect of weed mulch types on soil properties and yield of yam in Southwest Nigeria. *J. Soil. Nature*. 2008;2(3):01-05.
35. Odjugo PAO. The effect of tillage systems and mulching on soil microclimate, growth and yield of yellow yam (*Dioscorea cayenensis*) in Midwestern Nigeria. *African Journal of Biochemistry*. 2008;7(24):4500-4507.

© 2019 Mainoo and Banful; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:

The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
<http://www.sdiarticle3.com/review-history/46923>